

FINAL MEETING MINUTES
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS
TRANSIT COMMITTEE

Tuesday November 15, 2016
Maricopa Association of Governments; Saguaro Room;
302 N. 1st Avenue, Suite 200
Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS ATTENDING

*ADOT: Jaclyn Meli	*Paradise Valley: Jeremy Knapp
*Avondale: Kristen Taylor, Vice Chair	#Peoria: Rhonda Humbles for Stuart Kent
#Buckeye: Andrea Marquez	Phoenix: Maria Hyatt, Chair
Chandler: Jason Crampton for RJ Zeder	*Queen Creek: Vacant
El Mirage: Jose Macias	Scottsdale: Gregory P. Davies for
Gila River Indian Community, Greg McDowell	Madeline Clemann
Gilbert: Kristin Myers	Surprise: Martin Lucero
Glendale: Kevin Link for Debbie Albert	Tempe: Robert Yabes
#Goodyear: Christine McMurdy	*Tolleson: Vacant
#Maricopa: Kazi Haque for David Maestas	Valley Metro: Abhishek Dayal
Maricopa County DOT: Reed Kempton	#Youngtown: Grant Anderson
#Mesa: Jodi Sorrell	

* Members neither present nor represented
by proxy.

Participated (or attended) by teleconference
+ Participated (or attended) by videoconference

OTHERS PRESENT

Audra Koester Thomas, MAG	Jeff Martin, Chandler/Mesa
Marc Pearsall, MAG	Lisa Golden, Maricopa County DPH
Alice Chen, MAG	Joe Bowar, Phoenix
DeDe Gaisthea, MAG	Ken Kessler, Phoenix
Teri Kennedy, MAG	David Kohlbeck, Surprise
Leila Gamiz, MAG	Randy Overmyer, CivTech
Margaret Boone, MAG	ViVi Somphon, CivTech
	Amina Kruck, Ability 360
	Howard May Jr., transit advocate

1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 2:04 p.m. by Chair Maria Hyatt. She welcomed everyone in attendance and announced that a quorum was present. She noted that a few members were joining the meeting by teleconference: Andrea Marquez of Buckeye, Christine McMurdy of Goodyear, Kazi Haque of Maricopa, Jodi Sorrell of Mesa, Rhonda Humbles of Peoria and Grant Anderson of Youngtown. She asked if there were any public comment cards, and there being none, proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

2. Approval of Draft September 20, 2016 Meeting Minutes

Chair Hyatt inquired if there were any comments or corrections to the Draft September 20, 2016 Minutes. Hearing no comments, she called for a motion to approve the Draft September 20, 2016 Minutes. Jason Crampton of Chandler moved to approve the motion, Robert Yabes of seconded, and the motion passed unanimously. Chair Hyatt then proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

3. Call to the Audience

Chair Hyatt stated that she had not received any request to speak cards from the audience and moved onto the next item on the agenda.

4. Transit Planning Report

Chair Hyatt introduced the MAG Transit Planning Project Manager, Audra Koester Thomas. Ms. Koester Thomas then proceeded to brief the Committee with the Transit Planning Report.

She explained the FTA announced that the City of Phoenix had received \$2 million in a TOD grant for the South Central Light Rail Extension. Phoenix and Los Angeles received the maximum amounts out of 16 total organizations that will share a portion of the \$14.7 million grant supporting comprehensive planning efforts that improve access to public transit. Phoenix will use the funds to initiate a collaborative and proactive development, business assistance programs, improved bicycle/pedestrian infrastructure and planning work for opportunity sites in the area. The city partnered with MAG and Valley Metro to submit this grant application.

She also noted that Valley Metro received \$1 million in a Mobility on Demand grant to overhaul the Ridekick mobile app, integrating mobile ticketing and multi-modal trip planning. The Valley was one of 11 communities awarded from 5312 grant from an available amount of \$8 million, the Mobility on Demand Sandbox Demonstration Program. Valley Metro was partnering with Route Match Software, transit industry technology provider, as well as ASU, Lyft and the City of Phoenix Public Transit Department on the initial phase of this project.

The app intended to bridge the gap between public transit and ridesharing partners, as well as create a single payment solution, including a range of ride-hailing, bike-sharing and car-sharing companies, allowing all levels of income, age and people with disabilities to have access to an integrated, connected multi-modal transportation system.

She further noted that the MAG Regional Transit Framework Study Update work had been initiated with the Nelson\Nygaard team, mostly in data collection and project administrative activities. As the Committee already knew, this was largely a technical update of the 2010 study. As this project moves along, updates would be provided to the Transit Committee and briefings with stakeholders would be facilitated at key milestones. For the MAG Regional Commuter Rail System Study Update – MAG was facilitating contract negotiations with the AECOM team to facilitate the technical update of the 2010 Regional Commuter Rail System Study. MAG was also currently reviewing consultant respondents for our transportation on-call contract. Consultant selections and contracting would initiate after the New Year.

Ms. Koester Thomas then announced upcoming calendar items: On Wednesday, November 16 at 3 pm (Saguaro Rm) is the annual public hearing on draft report for Prop 400 implementation. She added that TRB was holding a Webinar viewing entitled “Practical Techniques for Successfully Communicating Technical Topics” earlier that day at noon, also in the Saguaro Room.

She mentioned that as a result of direction from the September meeting, MAG had been working with the City of Phoenix (as designated recipient) and Valley Metro on the status of FTA-awarded grants and would prepare a presentation for consideration by Transit Committee at an upcoming meeting.

Ms. Koester Thomas concluded by offering congratulations to Scott Smith who received support from the Valley Metro Boards of Directors to be retained as permanent CEO for a contract period of two years. Chair Hyatt thanked Ms. Koester Thomas and asked if there were further questions or comments regarding the agenda item. Hearing no further comments, she proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

5. Proposed Short-Term Transit Accessibility Program: Achieving Transit Accessibility Now (ATAN)

Chair Hyatt invited Ms. Alice Chen of MAG to brief the Committee with the Proposed Short-Term Transit Accessibility Program: Achieving Transit Accessibility Now (ATAN) program.

Ms. Chen noted that both she and Ron Brooks from Valley Metro would present elements the agenda item. She noted that there was a need for accessibility improvements at many of the transit stops across the MAG Region. The lack of consistent system-wide accessibility to and from transit stops can hinder individuals from getting to jobs, services, and educational institutions thus impacting their quality of life. The region had been proactive in responding to the needs of the community through the public involvement process as members of the community have frequently communicated to MAG the need for improved accessibility to transit stops and stations in the region.

Ms. Chen noted that in response to these requests, on June 22, 2016, the MAG Regional Council approved the availability of a total of \$2.5 million in regionally allocated funds in fiscal years 2016 and 2017 for improving accessibility to transit per the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). While the region conducted a study to inventory the transit stops in the region to evaluate their compliance to ADA standards and accessibility (anticipated completion in July 2017), an interim process to distribute funding for ADA compliance/transit stop accessibility improvements was needed. MAG was proposing a short-term implementation program with the goal of encouraging member agencies to be proactive and addressing immediate known needs as the study was being conducted.

She proceeded with her presentation and explained the ADA project time line in the MAG Region. She noted that on June 21, 2015 the MAG Regional Council approved \$250,000 for study and inventory, then on June 22, 2016 MAG Regional Council approved \$2.5 M in regionally allocated funds and in summer/fall 2016- MAG and Valley Metro draft Achieving Transit Accessibility Now (ATAN). In fall/winter 2016, the Transit Committee would review the ATAN and in winter/spring 2017 the Regional Council would approve ATAN. In spring 2017 requests would be submitted to MAG, with a spring/summer 2017 projects award and a summer 2017 regional study completion. In summer/fall 2017, the Transit Committee would review long-term ADA priorities and funding.

Ms. Chen then noted the ATAN Program Goals, which were to reestablish a simple application and approval process, allowed high level of agency discretion in spending in order to show immediate results. The plan would also limit funding to a short cycle (12 month award to draw down) and provide opportunities for project savings in executing multiple improvements at the same time. She also explained the project Nuts and Bolts. She noted that the following described funding per location; the maximum per stop location/stop was \$10,000 for concrete only (including limited sidewalk): with a \$40,000 federal/\$10,000 local; the minimum local match was 20% of total project costs where the local match may exceed 20%; the minimum per request (can include multiple agencies) is \$100,000: with a \$80,000 federal/\$20,000 local; and the minimum local match was 20% of total project costs where the local match may exceed 20%. She added that no single agency can be awarded more than 70% of available funding at that issuance if other eligible requests had been submitted. She also explained the minimum project parameters: stops served by routes that have had continuous service for over 3 years; infrastructure-ready projects (no environment clearance requirements or right-of-way needed); and improvements that increase the accessibility for transit users and are within 1/4 mile of a transit stop.

She then explained eligible activities. The programmed funding was intended to be used to address transit stop compliance in terms of improving or adding properly sized landing pad/s as well as compliant transit stop slope/s and cross slope/s. Additional amenities include: mobility device clearances, directional ramps (two per corner as opposed to a single), protective barriers to surrounding conditions, new/improved shelters, benches, trash receptacles, sidewalks (designed to meet longitudinal and cross-slope minimum requirements), truncated domes (at all crossing locations, from an approved products list), lightning, signing, striping/markings, information, fencing, cross walks (provided at needed locations and NOT provided at unnecessary locations), median cuts/pedestrian refuge areas (with proper slopes, domes and push button availability), pedestrian heads (visual and audible), push buttons (tactile and audible), visibility and/or safety improvements and bus pullouts.

She also explained Project Tracking. The elements included project locations, description of improvement(s), before/after photos and descriptions, ridership before/12 month after completion, total project amount, total construction costs, number of participating agencies, and time duration from start to completion of project. Ms. Chen and Mr. Brooks then reviewed the document that was sent with the application.

Ms. Chen offered to share some public comments from the MAG final phase of the public meeting from the last year's TIP development. "bus stops that are considered ADA compliant, but not necessarily user friendly...", "I want to address the need for prioritizing ADA improvements in your final proposed scenario because these kinds of improvements allow Maricopa residents with disabilities and their families to use our transit system.", "while a brand new bus could be put into service, the bus would not be a useful vehicle if some of its bus stops were inaccessible to passengers.", and "sidewalk needs to be wide enough so that riders using mobility devices like scooters or power wheelchairs from both buses can load and unload safely without the danger of tipping over because the sidewalk drops to gravel below."

She concluded by explaining the long-term process (FY 2017-beyond) of the implementation of long-term programming guidelines based on findings of the regional Transit Stop Inventory and Accessibility Study: the inclusion of funding for ADA compliance and accessibility in future Regional Transportation Plans; the develop and implement performance measures, focus on Title VI communities; evaluation short-term successes and identify other best practices; the development of a long-term programming methodology utilizing information from the Valley Metro Regional ADA Study that meets federal requirements; and the Annual Program Evaluation and report. She also noted that Valley Metro staff was always there to assist agencies on these issues, especially those who may lack resources at this time.

Ms. Chen completed her presentation. She also noted that she had received a public comment card from Amina Kruck of Ability 360 in order to speak on the pending agenda item.

Ms. Kruck then addressed the committee members. She explained that she was the Vice President of Advocacy at Ability 360 and had been an advocate for 25 years. She said that it was imperative that improvements be made to bus stops in order to provide more accessibility to passengers who require them. She said that due to physical barriers at or near the stops, there was a general lack of confidence by some passengers for their ability for safe access. She offered an example at Priest and Washington when buses may queue up, there become situations where passengers are boarding and alighting in the dirt, gravel or planters due to narrow confines of the sidewalk, unpaved areas or smaller bus pullouts. She also added that they are encouraging more seniors to use transit as they are aging in place. She also advised against planting trees in or near the sidewalks areas without tree grates, as these new amenities need to be vetted by all pedestrian groups before they are built. She noted further examples. She concluded by stating that she was happy and supportive of this new plan and hoped that new improvements would be implemented very soon.

Chair Hyatt thanked Ms. Kruck for her comments and Ms. Chen for her presentation and asked if there were further questions or comments regarding the agenda item.

Mr. Kempton of MCDOT had a few comments for MAG regarding ADA upgrade improvements for the pre-1990 bus stops. Ms. Myers of Gilbert stated that she was glad that there was a plan from MAG for the needs of ADA improvements in the community. Ms. Chen said that MAG would not limit agencies who were ready to move forward with their planning efforts, as Mr. Myers also noted that twelve months was a short time-frame. Ms. Kennedy said that there were hurdles for small projects and Mr. Yabes clarified if the application process would be first come first serve. Additional comments were made by Valley Metro and Chandler members.

Mr. Brooks continued to explain that regular paratransit had substantial growth, but that it had not been effectively managing trips from bus to para transit. He cited Utah Transit Authority's work and that there were metrics we must look at for boardings in bus and para transit and what system-wide changes could be implemented. Chair Hyatt commented that this was a complex bus stops plan for the region and with only two million to spend, she was concerned that it may not be enough for a wise allocation for some of the larger bus stops and projects. She noted that at this time, Phoenix would not participate in or solicit for the funding, which would leave more funding for other cities that have immediate needs. She added that perhaps the region consider \$250,000 for the first six months and the remaining allocated pending further review from the study. Ms. Chen noted that there were \$500,000 worth of requests and this funding could help some of those communities right now. Chair Hyatt noted that there was concern for using funds before the study is completed, when a full list of projects is not quite yet available.

Mr. Brooks replied that for every dollar that is used for a couple of these projects, it would help people that need service improvements as Valley Metro gets comments and requests from the community every week. It was also noted that a partnership could be engaged with the disabled community for use of these funds, to help Phoenix campaign for audible signals. Mr. Link also inquired on capital and federal funds. Ms. Kennedy mentioned that there would be a new funding rollout in January or February 2017. Ms. McMurdy of Goodyear also added that they would not be participating in the in the ADA funding at this time.

Chair Hyatt again thanked Ms. Chen, Mr. Brooks, the committee members and the public and asked if there were further questions or comments regarding the agenda item. Hearing no comments, she called for a motion to approve the item. Mr. Crampton of Chandler moved to approve the motion, Mr. Yabes of Tempe seconded, and the motion passed with two votes against by Chair Hyatt of Phoenix and Mr. Lucero of Surprise. Chair Hyatt then proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

6. Fiscal Year 2016 Program of Projects and Fiscal Years 2017-2022 Transportation Improvement Program Development Update

Chair Hyatt invited Alice Chen of MAG to present the item. She explained that in fiscal year 2017, MAG staff, in coordination with the MAG Transit Committee, the City of Phoenix/ (Designated Recipient) and Valley Metro would be developing the FY 2017 Program of Projects (POP) and FY 2018-2022 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP).

She added that the TIP development would follow the guidelines approved by the MAG Regional Council on March 27, 2013, last amended on June 22, 2016. She then reviewed the programming schedule and noted federal funds transit programming priorities (June 22, 2016), the MAG Regional Transit Survey (October 2015), approved projects under “Priority 8” for FY2016 Program of Projects and Fiscal Years 2017-2021 Transportation Improvement Program, as well as the next steps, and the TIP programming schedule (as of 11/15/2016) referenced for August 2016 through July 2017.

She further elaborated on Section 500: Programming Priorities (which were approved June 22, 2016), provided services and improvements as required by law, and provided funding for support services for grant management to the designated recipient, the City of Phoenix. She also noted the funding of preventive maintenance/operations/complementary ADA Service, and preventive maintenance funding for the Phoenix-Mesa-Glendale UZA would be distributed based on approved methodology outlined in Section 400. The baseline funding would be 25% of 5307 funds.

She then explained that the Avondale/Goodyear UZA would receive operations funding in line with 2012 for the FY TIP years 2014-2018, funding the Job Access Reverse Commute program using the process outlined in Section 703, supporting the Transit Life Cycle Program (TLCP) capital bus program, supporting the TLCP capital facility program, supporting the other TLCP projects as the program is updated, funding additional projects based through a collaborative process by assessing regional transit needs, implementing elements of adopted regional efforts, meeting regional performance based criteria, and the MAG Regional Transit Survey (October 2015).

She added details of the current Fiscal Year 2016-2021 Transportation Program, (approved by MAG Regional Council on June 22, 2016), included eliminating the JARC sub-allocation in fiscal years 2016 and 2017, funding \$2.5 million for ADA accessibility improvements to bus stops in FY 2016-2017, funding approximately 55-60 expansion vehicles over 6 years, funding ITS and infrastructure projects that benefit all operators, and leaving \$6.0 million un-programmed from FY 2018-2021 to be discussed (options include JARC, ADA, expansion vehicles, ITS) in the next TIP development cycle.

She then concluded by noting the next steps, which included reconciling the programming priorities with federal funded projects and the Transit Life Cycle program projects for FY 2017-2022. A regional transit survey could also be conducted (if needed). Chair Hyatt again thanked Ms. Chen and asked if there were further questions or comments regarding the agenda item. Hearing none, she proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

7. Federal Transit Administration (FTA) Funding Projections for the MAG Region

Chair Hyatt invited Teri Kennedy of MAG to present the item. Ms. Kennedy reviewed the CMAQ flex funding from 2020-2023 and advised that the UZAs would change in the Region. She noted that MAG, in coordination with Valley Metro-RPTA and City of Phoenix as Designated Recipient/Direct Recipient of FTA funds, had developed revised FTA projections for the MAG region based on the FAST Act, guidance information, and historical projections. She also explained that FTA regional projections would be used to prepare the Draft FFY2017 POP, Draft FY2018-2022 TIP, and Draft FY2040 Regional Transportation Plan (RTP). All three draft documents were expected to be included in the June 2017 MAG Regional Council agenda for final approval.

Chair Hyatt again thanked Ms. Kennedy and asked if there were further questions or comments regarding the agenda item. Hearing none, she proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

8. Request for Future Agenda Items

Chair Hyatt asked the members of the Committee if there were any issues or topics that they would like added as future agenda items. Hearing no further comments, Chair Hyatt proceeded to the next item on the agenda.

9. Next Meeting Date

Chair Hyatt thanked those in attendance and announced that the next scheduled meeting of the MAG Transit Committee, if needed, would be held on Tuesday, December 20, 2016 at 2:00 p.m. in the MAG Office, Saguaro Room.

There being no further business, she adjourned the meeting at 3:30 p.m.